

United States Patent and Trademark Office

UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF COMMERCE United States Patent and Trademark Office Address: COMMISSIONER FOR PATENTS P.O. Box 1450 Alexandria, Virginia 22313-1450 www.uspto.gov

APPLICATION NO.	FILING DATE	FIRST NAMED INVENTOR	ATTORNEY DOCKET NO.	CONFIRMATION NO.
09/747,713	12/22/2000	Steven M. Burns	EH-10443	4298
7590 09/26/2006			EXAMINER	
Pratt & Whitney Legal Department-Patent Section Mail Stop 132-13			RACHUBA, MAURINA T	
			ART UNIT	PAPER NUMBER
400 Main Street			3723	
East Hartford, CT 06108			DATE MAILED: 09/26/2006	

Please find below and/or attached an Office communication concerning this application or proceeding.

) of				
	Application No.	Applicant(s)				
Office Action Summer	09/747,713	BURNS ET AL.				
Office Action Summary	Examiner	Art Unit				
The MAILING DATE of this committee is	M Rachuba	3723				
The MAILING DATE of this communication appears on the cover sheet with the correspondence address Period for Reply						
A SHORTENED STATUTORY PERIOD FOR REPLY IS SET TO EXPIRE MONTH(S) OR THIRTY (30) DAYS, WHICHEVER IS LONGER, FROM THE MAILING DATE OF THIS COMMUNICATION. - Extensions of time may be available under the provisions of 37 CFR 1.136(a). In no event, however, may a reply be timely filed after SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. - If NO period for reply is specified above, the maximum statutory period will apply and will expire SIX (6) MONTHS from the mailing date of this communication. - Failure to reply within the set or extended period for reply will, by statute, cause the application to become ABANDONED (35 U.S.C. § 133). Any reply received by the Office later than three months after the mailing date of this communication, even if timely filed, may reduce any earned patent term adjustment. See 37 CFR 1.704(b).						
Status						
1) Responsive to communication(s) filed on 19 July 2006.						
· —	This action is FINAL . 2b)⊠ This action is non-final.					
	3) Since this application is in condition for allowance except for formal matters, prosecution as to the merits is					
closed in accordance with the practice under Ex parte Quayle, 1935 C.D. 11, 453 O.G. 213.						
Disposition of Claims						
4)⊠ Claim(s) <u>1,7-9 and 18</u> is/are pending in the application.						
4a) Of the above claim(s) is/are withdrawn from consideration.						
5) Claim(s) is/are allowed.						
6)⊠ Claim(s) <u>1,7-9 and 18</u> is/are rejected.						
7) Claim(s) is/are objected to.						
8) Claim(s) are subject to restriction and/or election requirement.						
Application Papers						
9) The specification is objected to by the Examiner.						
10)⊠ The drawing(s) filed on <u>22 December 2002</u> is/are: a)⊠ accepted or b)⊡ objected to by the Examiner.						
Applicant may not request that any objection to the drawing(s) be held in abeyance. See 37 CFR 1.85(a).						
Replacement drawing sheet(s) including the correction is required if the drawing(s) is objected to. See 37 CFR 1.121(d).						
11) The oath or declaration is objected to by the Examiner. Note the attached Office Action or form PTO-152.						
Priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119						
12) Acknowledgment is made of a claim for foreign priority under 35 U.S.C. § 119(a)-(d) or (f).						
a) ☐ All b) ☐ Some * c) ☐ None of:						
1. Certified copies of the priority documents have been received.						
Certified copies of the priority documents have been received in Application No Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage.						
3. Copies of the certified copies of the priority documents have been received in this National Stage application from the International Bureau (PCT Rule 17.2(a)).						
* See the attached detailed Office action for a list of the certified copies not received.						
and a second sec						
Attachment(e)						
Attachment(s) 1) Notice of References Cited (PTO-892) 4) Interview Summary (PTO-413)						
2) Notice of Draftsperson's Patent Drawing Review (PTO-948)	Paper No(s)/Mail Da	ate				
3) Information Disclosure Statement(s) (PTO/SB/08) Paper No(s)/Mail Date	5) Notice of Informal P. 6) Other:	atent Application				
C Delegational College						

Application/Control Number: 09/747,713 Page 2

Art Unit: 3723

DETAILED ACTION

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 112

1. Applicant's amendment has overcome the rejection under 35 USC 112.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 102

2. The following is a quotation of the appropriate paragraphs of 35 U.S.C. 102 that form the basis for the rejections under this section made in this Office action:

A person shall be entitled to a patent unless -

- (b) the invention was patented or described in a printed publication in this or a foreign country or in public use or on sale in this country, more than one year prior to the date of application for patent in the United States.
- 3. Claims 1 and 18 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 102(b) as being clearly anticipated by Highberg, 3,236,009. Please see figure 1, table 2, and column 7, lines 47 through column 8, lines 61.

Claim Rejections - 35 USC § 103

- 4. The following is a quotation of 35 U.S.C. 103(a) which forms the basis for all obviousness rejections set forth in this Office action:
 - (a) A patent may not be obtained though the invention is not identically disclosed or described as set forth in section 102 of this title, if the differences between the subject matter sought to be patented and the prior art are such that the subject matter as a whole would have been obvious at the time the invention was made to a person having ordinary skill in the art to which said subject matter pertains. Patentability shall not be negatived by the manner in which the invention was made.
- 5. This application currently names joint inventors. In considering patentability of the claims under 35 U.S.C. 103(a), the examiner presumes that the subject matter of the various claims was commonly owned at the time any inventions covered therein were made absent any evidence to the contrary. Applicant is advised of the obligation under 37 CFR 1.56 to point out the inventor and invention dates of each claim that was not commonly owned at the time a later invention was made in order for the examiner to

Art Unit: 3723

consider the applicability of 35 U.S.C. 103(c) and potential 35 U.S.C. 102(e), (f) or (g) prior art under 35 U.S.C. 103(a).

Page 3

6. Claims 1, 7-9 and 18 are rejected under 35 U.S.C. 103(a) as being unpatentable over Liebke et al, 5,702,288 in view of Highberg, 3,236,009. Please refer to column 4, lines 10 through column 5, lines 35. '288 discloses a method for preparing a substrate, for any further processing, comprising removing material from a surface, the surface having a layer of MCrAIY coating, applied by EBPVD. The coating is adherent, (column 4, lines 5-6). '288 does not disclose that the material removal is progressively decreased during the process. '009, teaches removing material from a workpiece at a progressively decreasing rate. It would have been obvious to one of ordinary skill to have provided the process of '288 with the decreasing rate of material removal taught by '009, figure 1, table 2, and column 7, lines 47 through column 8, lines 61, to ensure long life to the tool, and excellent results with economy to the entire process, see column 8, lines 63-74.

Response to Arguments

7. Applicant's arguments, see page 5, lines 19-21, filed 19 July 2006, with respect to claims 1, 7-9 and 18 have been fully considered and are persuasive. The rejection of claims 1, 7-9 and 19 under 35 USC 102 over Liebke et al has been withdrawn. A new grounds of rejection, based on Highberg, alone or combined with Liebke et al, is set forth above. This action is made non-final to provide applicant fair opportunity to respond to the new grounds of rejection.

Art Unit: 3723

Conclusion

8. Any inquiry concerning this communication or earlier communications from the examiner should be directed to M Rachuba whose telephone number is 571-272-4493. The examiner can normally be reached on Monday-Fridays.

If attempts to reach the examiner by telephone are unsuccessful, the examiner's supervisor, Joseph Hail can be reached on 571-272-4485. The fax phone number for the organization where this application or proceeding is assigned is 571-273-8300.

Information regarding the status of an application may be obtained from the Patent Application Information Retrieval (PAIR) system. Status information for published applications may be obtained from either Private PAIR or Public PAIR. Status information for unpublished applications is available through Private PAIR only. For more information about the PAIR system, see http://pair-direct.uspto.gov. Should you have questions on access to the Private PAIR system, contact the Electronic Business Center (EBC) at 866-217-9197 (toll-free).

M Rachuba Primary Examiner Page 4

Art Unit 3723